

CIVIL SERVICES REFORMS: A ROAD TO COMPREHENSIVE NATIONAL SECURITY OF PAKISTAN

Mr. Qazi Jamil*

'Civil service is the backbone of the State. Governments are formed, governments are defeated, Prime Ministers come and go, ministers come and go, but you stay on'
(Quaid e Azam, Muhammad Ali Jinnah)

Abstract

Civil service is the driver of state machinery and its efficiency determines state's effectiveness in performing its core functions. Pakistan inherited 95 civil servants and around 300 class-1 officers at the time of independence. This core group had to meet the challenges with meager resources. The civil service not only managed to restore order, taxation and communication but it went on devising a long-term development plan. In 1960s, this group was declared 'agents of change' and 'engine of growth and development'. Yet with the passage of time, degeneration crept in; turning the glorious past into a dream. Over the years, multiple commissions have been constituted for civil service reforms; however, these efforts have not been able to effect discernible change in service delivery. It therefore, necessitates a thorough analysis of existing structures and underlying causes in order to transform our civil service into an efficient and robust organ of state contributing to the comprehensive national security of Pakistan.

Keywords: Civil Services, Governance, Growth, Management, Resources, Reforms, Social Contract

Introduction

Social contract between the state and its people is premised on security, welfare and prosperity forming the core of human security. These determinants are intertwined warranting an enhanced focus on service delivery for effective governance. Civil service is the driver of state machinery and its efficiency determines state's effectiveness in performing its core functions. On independence, Pakistan inherited 95 civil servants and around 300 class-1 officers. This core group had to meet the challenges with meager resources, not only managed to restore order, taxation and communication but went on to devise a long term development plan. In 1960s, this group was declared 'agents of change' and 'engine of growth and development'. Yet with the passage of time, degeneration crept in; turning the glorious past into a dream. Over the years, multiple commissions have been constituted for civil service reforms; however, these efforts have not been able to effect discernible change in service delivery. It therefore, necessitates a thorough analysis of existing structures and underlying causes in order to transform our civil service into an efficient and robust organ of state contributing to the comprehensive national security of Pakistan. In this background, this paper evaluates civil services including past reforms with a view to proposing reform package for efficient public service delivery.

* Mr. Qazi Jamil is an independent researcher based in Islamabad.

Civil Services - The Edifice of National Security

“To achieve the vast potential of our citizens, it is necessary to promote delivery-based good governance through strengthening of institutions, rule of law, transparency, accountability, and openness”.

(NSP of Pakistan-2022)

The dynamics of national security have transformed remarkably in the 21st century, as nontraditional security threats have gained significance over traditional security threats. The concept of “Comprehensive National Security” is now more diversified which besides covering traditional security of State, also lays importance on Human Security (well-being of its citizens).¹ Human security moves away from traditional, state-centric conceptions of security to security and empowerment of the individuals. It draws attention to a multitude of threats that cut across different aspects of human life and thus highlights the interface between security, development and human rights. It promotes a new integrated, coordinated and people-centered approach towards security. It comprises three fundamental freedoms including freedom from fear (human survival), freedom from want (human development) and freedom to live in dignity.² Translating these freedoms into actionable goals, the UNDP proposed seven components of human security which include political, economic, personal, community, health, food and environmental security.³

Human security paradigm poses serious challenges to the State of Pakistan. Analysis of selected domains reveal that, while realization exists, formulation of effective policies and stringent implementation remains wanting. Case in point is e-governance, where realization was felt in 2003, periodic measures were taken, yet Pakistan stands at 150th position even after 20 years, well below the global & regional average. Human security is people centered, multi-sectoral, context specific, prevention oriented and comprehensive. Strengthened human security will strengthen comprehensive national security. Pakistan faces humungous human security challenges which are inextricably linked with effective governance and efficient public administration. Dismal state of human security landscape and role of civil services dictate dire need for a comprehensive reforms package for civil services of Pakistan.

Civil Service in Pakistan: Structural Overview

There are 12 x occupational groups in civil services recruited annually through the Central Superior Service (CSS) examination held by the Federal Public Service Commission (FPSC). The demands, probable outcomes and pressures of job vary for each service group. Ex-Cadre officers mainly belong to technical and professional categories, for example, specialized positions in Ministries and attached departments, subordinate offices, bureaus, commissions and research organizations. Provincial Management / Civil Service (PMS / PCS) are inducted by Provincial Public Service Commissions (PPSC) through competitive exam.⁴ PMS Officers come from many streams, i.e. 50% through promotion from amongst Tehsildars, Superintendents, Personal Secretaries, etcetera and

50% through open merit competitive examination held every year. However, the main chunk of officers are recruited directly into the BPS 17 after qualifying rigorous examinations (Civil Service Exam of 12 papers). They are appointed in Tehsil, District and Divisions as well as in Provincial Secretariats. Since 2021, PMS/PCS officers are now being inducted into Pakistan Administrative Service (PAS) in BS-19 as per provincial quotas through Federal Public Service Commission (FPSC). PMS Cadre enjoys the legal and constitutional status as a recognized service segment of the federating units of Pakistan.

Apart from PMS/PCS, officers are inducted through FPSC in professional/ technical/ specialized posts and are governed by Civil Services Act 1973 called as Ex-Cadre officers. Technical and Professional Services/Cadres include FIA, Education, Planning Commission/ Economist Group, Corporations and attached departments, Agriculture, Health, Forestry, Veterinary, Engineering, Information and Law etc. which are also inducted through PPSCs. Article 240-242 provide provisions for Civil Service of Pakistan and establishes Public Service Commissions for their selection. There are two broad categories of employees which fall under BS 1-16 and then BS 17 and above. The total number of employees in civil services of Pakistan today is around 0.5 Million⁵ out of which 90% of the bureaucracy consists of employees from grade 1-15 while the remaining 10% are officers in grade 16-22. Among this 10%, the share of the Central Superior Services is only 5%.

Induction is regulated by Civil Servants (Appointment & Promotion) Rules, 1973; and Federal Public Service Commission (FPSC) Rules, 1978. Recruitment is carried out through CSS, PMS, and promotion through exam keeping in view the quota system. Second-class graduate degree of Pakistan or an equivalent foreign qualification is a pre-requisite for CSS. Examination includes written part based on six compulsory and six optional subjects and a psychological test. A Preliminary Screening Test has been added since 2022. Quota system was introduced in 1973 for 10 years to ensure balanced representation of federation. However, additional quotas were introduced with time. It includes open merit 7.5%, Punjab 50%, Sind 19%, KPK 11.5%, Balochistan 6%, GB/NMD 4% and AJK 2%. Occupational groups are assigned to successful candidates based on overall position and provincial quotas. Further, each province has its own Public Service Commission, like FPSC and is responsible for recruitment to Provincial Civil Service which is now at par with CSS. Induction for ex cadre officers is done directly by Public Service Commissions on requisition from different ministries. A special quota of 10% for military officers and 5% for female candidates is also given. Induction is done through promotion for BS-11-16 through separate exams, in Customs, Police and Secretariat Group.

Civil servants undergo mandatory/ departmental training. All officers in BS-17, after having qualified CSS, undergo pre-service training. Common Training Programme (CTP) is organized for Grade-17 officers appointed as probationers at Civil Services Academy (CSA) Lahore. CSA conducts Specialized Training Programme (STP) for Pakistan Administrative Services (PAS) while other groups undergo STP at their respective training institutions. PMS/PCS probationers are trained in their respective

provincial academies. While in-service training programmes include mid-career management course (MCMC), senior management course (SMC), national management course (NMC) and national security course (NSC). MCMC⁶ is a pre-requisite for promotion to BS-19. It is conducted at National School of Public Policy (NSPP) through its integral units, the National Institutes of Management (NIM) across the country. SMC⁷ is pre-requisite for promotion to BS-20. This training is also conducted by NIM for federal and provincial government officers of BS-19 to enhance leadership abilities and improve service delivery. NMC is pre-requisite for promotion to BS-21-22. This is conducted at the National Management College of the National School of Public Policy (NSPP). A limited number of officers drawn from various occupational groups are detailed for NSC in lieu of the National Management Course. This course includes serving officers from military, civil service (BS-20) and friendly countries.

General criteria for promotion is *seniority-cum-fitness*. Departmental Promotion Committee (DPC) recommends promotions and transfer to posts in BPS 2-18. Provincial DPCs perform similar functions but differ in composition as per grade of candidates. Departmental Selection Board (DSB) recommends selection and transfer to posts in BPS 18-19 and equivalent which is headed by the Secretary of the concerned Ministry/ Division. Selection to posts in BPS 20-21 and equivalent are made on recommendations of Central Selection Board (CSB) headed by Chairman FPSC, Establishment Secretary, Cabinet Secretary and four federal secretaries as its members. Provincial CSBs are headed by Chief Secretaries and perform similar functions in respective provinces. Moreover, High Powered Board performs selection to BS-22 under the Prime Minister.

Performance Evaluation Reports (PER) are used to record performance of subordinate officers by reporting officers. PER comprises of 6 parts including personal details, brief record of performance by officer reported upon, personality assessment and pen picture by reporting officer, followed by remarks of counter-signing officers. The weightage of PERs for promotion include 40% for quantification of PERRs, 30% for training evaluation report and 30% for evaluation of CSB/PSB and DSB.

Remuneration⁸ include pay scales, pensions and allied benefits. There are 22 Basic Pay Scales (BPS) which form the basis of salary package along with numerous allowances. Other than BPS, Management Position (MP) Scales. Special Pay Scales (SPS) for civil servants working in public sector corporations are also in use. Pension is calculated as 70% of last drawn basic salary. If the raises granted by successive governments are included, pension becomes up to 122-140% of last drawn salary in some cases. On the average, a person who serves in government for 25 years or more, draws a pension until he or she turns 80 years. Benefits of civil servants include house, government transport, medical expenditure refund and government funded training. Federal Government Employees Housing Authority (FGEHA) provides eligible federal government employees with housing/ plots. Their conduct and discipline is governed Government Servants (Conduct) Rules, 1964 and Government Servants (Efficiency & Discipline) Rules, 1973. A Federal Service Tribunal in Federal Government while a Provincial Service Tribunal at each province exist for redressal of appeals and petitions as

per Civil Servants Appeal Rules, 1977. Several other legal instruments regulate functioning of civil bureaucracy, within these federal and provincial acts. Civil Establishment (ESTA) Code is a vast compendium of laws, operating procedures, rules and regulations to govern civil services.

Civil Service Reforms: Historical Overview

The Era of Bureaucratic Dominance (1947-1958). Pakistan inherited a well-structured judiciary, civil service and military but a weak system of legislative oversight. Frequent changes in political leadership in 1950s created governance vacuum which was filled by bureaucracy. Civil servants initially enjoyed security of service with merit-based recruitment and performance-based promotions. Hence their performance remained par excellence.

Ford Foundation sponsored Dr. Rowland Egger to visit Pakistan to study the administrative set up and recommend changes. The Egger Report in 1953 made four major recommendations. First was the creation of properly coordinated central secretariat, second, equity of technocrat with general cadre officers, third, maintenance of balance between the centralization and the grass root and fourth was creation of unified cadre of all services.

Among the actions taken in his first few years by General Ayub Khan as the Chief Martial Law Administrator, was reforming the civil services of the country. The Ghulam Ahmed Committee Report evolved around reduction of tiers in the Central Secretariat and it suggested an innovated idea, borrowed from the American school of thought to reduce the decisionmaking tiers and reducing time for decision making and implementation. The Report suggested creation of Section Officer System replacing several layers of subordinate staff. The scheme was put into effect from October, 1959 by promoting then superintendents and assistants and unifying them with under secretaries and assistant secretaries to act as the new cadre of officers, called section officers which is functional till date. President Ayub's era is known as the 'Golden Era of Bureaucracy' in the Civil Services as their performance was not hindered by political representative and public service delivery was commendable.

Cornelius Commission (1969) was commissioned as a Service Reorganization Commission to restructure the entire bureaucratic machinery was notified with Justice Cornelius as its chairman with twelve members acting as representatives of the stakeholders. The terms of reference were "eliminating corruption and arbitrary decision making" and "providing equal opportunities to all employees of the government to rise to the highest position". This was a very comprehensive reports on pay and service structure but were partially implemented.

General Zia's government announced a Civil Services Reform Commission under Chief Justice Syed Anwar-ul-Haq in 1979. The Commission was provided the Terms of Reference to "review the structure and organization of the civil services with a view to enhance efficiency and professionalism" but in essence its task was review of the

administrative reforms of 1973 including an assessment and evaluation of the changes brought about by these Reforms. The Commission reported that Administrative Reforms did little towards advancing professionalism in the administrative set up, for undertaking job analysis and grading of senior posts. General Zia approved discontinuation of lateral entrants into the services but he allowed fixed quota of 10% for Armed Forces officers.

President Musharraf introduced the Devolution of Power Plan (DOPP) in 2001. This Plan transferred powers to the provinces and local governments. The district 'Nazim' was made chief executive of the local government with immense powers while abolishing posts of Divisional, Deputy and Assistant Commissioners.⁹ Bureaucracy was not de-politicized. The National Commission for Government Reforms (NCGR) was established which proposed certain useful recommendations for civil service reforms. However, the reforms remained short-lived due to change of regime in 2008 and implementation issues.

President Asif Zardari, in order to restore the Constitution in its original 1973 form, introduced the 18th Amendment. For rolling out the said Amendment, an Implementation Commission was formed to bring about changes in civil services including Federal and Provincial Public Service Commissions. Incidents of junior officers in BS-18 and 19 being given key posts based on loyalty, nepotism and corruption became non-issues. In addition, DMG was renamed as Pakistan Administrative Service (PAS).

Pakistan Vision-2025 initiated under Ministry of Planning, Development & Reforms in 2015 included Civil Service Reform as its important pillar. It aimed to reform Federal Civil Service while reviewing the recommendations of NCGR especially post-18th Amendment. Key proposals were performance evaluation of civil servants through annual evaluation system based on attributes of leadership and acquired skillsets, organizational performance evaluations based on deliverables and Key Performance Indicators for ministries and establishment of National University for Public Policy and Administration for training of cadre and ex-cadre officer. No efforts for de-politicizing civil service and improving transparency in postings, promotions and transfers were undertaken. The reforms lacked long-term vision and were abandoned due to resistance from federal bureaucracy.

Systemic Voids

Political interference in transfers, postings, day-to-day work and performance of civil servants is both a chronic and acute issue. Decisions about promotion, training, transfer and posting after reviewing the performance record of civil servants making career progression contingent to meeting performance targets are the needs of the hour which need to be addressed through informed policy makers without any political pressure and interference. Civil service is demotivated and controlled by continuous political interference which is rooted in the rules of civil service, whereby a political executive controls the placements, transfers, disciplinary matters, and promotions of civil servants which is not the practice in the Army and Judiciary. Extra representation in Board with increased weightage also plays in creating 'yes man culture' instead of

focusing on the 'writ of the state'".

Anti-graft Coercion is another problem.¹⁰ Owing to politicization of these institutions, civil servants are often subjected to coercion from multiple directions which makes them demoralized and risk averse. Corruption in civil service is endemic with accusations of bribery and graft. There are many institutions with assumed jurisdiction over Civil Service and are usually used as instruments of coercion. These include NAB, FIA, Federal / Provincial Ombudsman and Provincial Anti-Corruption Establishments. Absence of a robust internal accountability mechanism precludes control of corruption and misuse of authority.

Due to unstable political regimes, inconsistent policies and infrastructural deficiencies public sector organizations are unable to give due importance. The public sector organizations focus remains on day-to-day firefighting. The important facet of ensuring public service as per mandated requirements, which should form part of efficient performance rendered by a civil servant, gets sidelined.

Major impediment to good performance in public service delivery institutions and civil service is the lack of integration in the existing infrastructure. For instance, climate change, health, education etc. an integrated response spread over various departments is essential, but remains fragmented. Separate policy-making though required by every department is not coordinated and interlinked which is a stumbling block towards good governance and is further complicated by the federal and province to tehsil divide.

Public service delivery in most federal and provincial departments lacks the capacity or resources to adopt efficient automated services and overly relies on manual work. Inadequate technological-driven public service delivery has led to reduced productivity of government departments. Common man finds it difficult to access public services as there is lack of online mechanisms for sharing information and improving communication with citizenry.

With exponential population growth, the required manpower and resources have not been matched. The systems are overburdened with tasks beyond global standards of workload versus the workforce or resource allocation. The limitation of resources, manpower, and no say in decision-making, with limited or no authority, breeds complacency for mediocrity and demotivates the workforce.

With no job descriptions specified and KPIs not clearly defined and created, the organizations face trouble in performance management. The implementation of policies and public service delivery will be affected if the organization's goals and objectives are not known to the public sector employees with no sense of accountability. The format is dependent on personal intervention so far and needs to be automated to do away with 'Halo effect'.

Understaffing and poor infrastructural support have left the civil servants

grappling with the job dispensation with lack of authority in decision making or implementation strategy at Federal level.

Global Practices

After having analysed various systemic, structural and service delivery issues in Civil Service of Pakistan, certain relatable case studies focusing on contemporary best practices in civil services have been identified. It is pertinent to mention that selection of Contemporary Models has been carried out after considering the Forms of Government, history, system of governance and international ratings. The 'Governance Effectiveness Index'¹¹ as mentioned in the table below reflects perceptions of the quality of public services, the quality of the civil service and the degree of its independence from political pressures, the quality of policy formulation and implementation, and the credibility of the government's commitment to such policies.

United Kingdom has one of best civil services in the world contoured along certain best practices including 'Strategic Leadership', 'Civil Service Code' and 'Citizens' Charter'. The Civil Service Board (CSB) was established to afford strategic direction of civil services for ensuring its systematic improvement and to make sure that it works as a coherent organisation. Chaired by the Civil Service Chief Operating Officer, it is comprised of permanent secretaries from Civil Service departments. It is the responsibility of the Civil Service Board (CSB) to consider the strategic challenges faced by the Civil Service, collectively agreeing a way forward and making recommendations to ministers on key issues.

Citizens' Charter initiative¹² was launched for solving the problems which a citizen encounters, while dealing with the organizations providing public services. Citizen Charters (CCs) are public agreements between citizens and service delivery providers that clearly codify expectations and standards in the realm of service delivery. Introduced by the United Kingdom in the early 1990s, CCs are now being used in a wide range of countries including the United States, Kenya, India, Singapore, Jamaica, and Mexico to improve the quality of service delivery and enhance public sector management. Effective CCs typically share a number of key characteristics, including clear and simple language; realistic and measurable performance standards; a dedicated grievance redress mechanism; and an effective public relations strategy to increase users' awareness. The basic objective of the Citizens Charter is to empower the citizen in relation to public service delivery.

To establish credibility of United Kingdom civil services besides ensuring their quality, civil service code was introduced in 2006 to outline the core values and standards expected of civil servants. The core values are defined as integrity, honesty, objectivity, and impartiality. The code also includes an independent line of appeal to the Civil Service Commissioners on alleged breaches of the code by general public to ensure transparency through public scrutiny.

The Singapore Civil Service is widely regarded as one of the most efficient and

uncorrupt bureaucracies in the world, with a high standard of discipline and accountability. With respect to the high quality of its civil service, a number of factors play a significant role, among which are civil service training and E- governance. The Public Service Division (PSD), which is under the Prime Ministry office, acts as a coordinating agency of civil service training-related issues. It develops general policy guidelines, within which civil service organisations and the civil service training institutions make training-related decisions. It also coordinates activities between Civil Service College and the civil service organisations. Policymakers and senior civil servants are committed to civil service training. As a result, huge amounts of money have been invested in training programmes. The minimum training target is 100 hours per civil servant per year, of which 60% is on work-related courses and 40% on selfdevelopment courses.

Singapore civil service training is performed by three major institutions: the Institute of Policy Development (IPD), the Institute of Public Administration and Management (IPAM), and the Civil Service College Consultants (CSCC). Managed under a Civil Service College (CSC) which is the central training and development institution for civil servants. It conducts more than over 400 programmes across 22 domains. The college establishes linkage with local partnering organizations, academic institutions, regional and international institutions to share and get new findings of research and other innovations to increase relevance and innovative capacity.

The e-Governance movement in Singapore has become an integral part of a much larger national strategy to transform the island city-state into an "intelligent island" where the e-Economy will be a centerpiece of the economic development plans and where the e-Society will be an inclusive community of citizens and residents, enjoying a high quality of life. Thus, e-Governance in Singapore is perceived as a strategic and integrated developmental force in the service of the nation. Singapore's e-Government strategic framework is centered on three critical relationships – Government to Citizens (G2C), Government to Businesses (G2B) and Government to Employees (G2E). Based on that framework, an e-Governance Action Plan was launched in 2000.

Basing upon the evaluation of best practices identified as a result of selected case studies, following can be inferred:

- A strategic leadership organ of civil service is essential for achieving its vision.
- A well-defined 'Code of Conduct' provides a benchmark for ensuring quality of service delivery.
- Citizen's Charter fosters greater public satisfaction regarding government's performance.
- Futuristic and collaborative training mechanism is essential for optimum human resource development in Civil Services.
- E-Governance is a force multiplier for efficient service delivery.
- Constitutional Safeguards mitigate negative effects of political and personality-based interference.

Reform Strategy

Having established the need of strengthening Civil Services for improvement in public service delivery, it is pertinent to highlight that implementation of reform package would require certain enabling conditions. Major conditions considered prerequisite for revitalization of Civil Services are political ownership, institutional authority for oversight and implementation, constitutional and legal cover for effective implementation and favouring national interest over personal/organizational interest. The broader contours of the reform package are enhancing proficiency, empowering the people and strengthening federation.

Role of existing Federal and Provincial Public Service Commissions be expanded as Apex bodies of civil services under the leadership of the respective Chairman PSC. Rules of business for functions related to accountability and discipline will be formulated to ensure decision making through a committee headed by Chairman FPSC without prejudicial powers to override the committees' decisions. As there is no authority/ think tank to assess latest trends in civil services, interface with think tanks and seek academic inputs. Therefore, a Strategic Direction Board be established under FPSC to undertake these functions. Public Service Commissions (PSC) be structurally enabled to carryout policy, induction, training, promotions (BPS 19-21), discipline and accountability functions. Role and interfacing of Establishment Division/ other Departments with PSCs may be reviewed by the implementation Committee.

A Strategic Direction Board (SDB) under FPSC be established which will not only act as a think tank and reforms implementation entity but will act as a quality inspection and evaluation unit in future.

Induction base be broadened and the posts from BS 18-21 be increased so as to ensure competitive promotion. In order to strengthen ministries through subject matter experts, a Technical pool be created in all Ministries which should have three main components including legal, information & communication technology and domain specific. Technical positions will be identified by Ministries; and FPSC will conduct recruitment process. Unfilled quota vacancies of provinces be included in open merit induction. Quotas for disabled / special needs person and women from under-developed areas be maintained.

Training needs assessment be carried out based on organizational needs which should focus on public dealing, specialization and management skills. A pre mid-career training be conducted within five years of induction. Reciprocal / paid training be arranged abroad. Courses be selected to ensure merit-based selection of officers from initial, middle and senior tiers of service. Leadership management programs be carried out at reputed institutions inland and abroad. Induction/ Training wing at FPSC to coordinate standardised training regime with provincial PSCs. NSPP be designated as Apex body for training standards, monitoring and quality assistance to all training institutes through Induction / training wings of PSCs for implementation. Training curriculum be updated annually with feedbacks from the Technical Assessment Groups.

It is recommended that Job Descriptions and KPIs of all posts be developed forthwith, Performance Evaluation Reports be digitized and all Reporting & Countersigning officers be bound to complete these in two months so that officers don't have to run around for getting PERs.

There is a dire need of a strong Internal Accountability system and it is recommended that FPSC be empowered to undertake this. Disciplinary actions against officers beyond Grade 19 be carried out by FPSC. Directory Rules of Retirement which warrant directory retirement of officers on twice supersession, and misconduct be implemented to ensure weeding out of non performing officers. Likewise, performance review of all officers be conducted after 10/20 years of induction; to ensure attrition of non performing officers.

In order to ensure placement on merit, Placement Committees are recommended at the federal and provincial level under PSCs comprising of senior civil servants. Ministries to identify pivotal positions (Federal /Provincial Secretaries) and FPSC to recommend a panel of three officers to authorities for selection.

In order to get rid of arbitrary transfer regime which is a major source of insecurity amongst civil servants, it is recommended that on all pivotal positions, Minimum two years tenure be ensured, Exception to this rule should only be through approval of PM/CM. On premature transfer, the aggrieved officer may have the right to approach FPSC.

In order to promote merit and transparency, Central Selection Board to comprise only of civil servants and CSB must be held twice a year and promotions be notified within one month so that there is no uncertainty.

There is a dire need to Protect Civil servants from public litigation for the actions done in good faith. Similarly, it is recommended that Anti-corruption bodies to seek 'Sanction for Prosecution' from FPSC for any action done in good faith through a written request. If there is a difference of opinion between the two bodies then the Anti-Corruption authority may approach the court for sanction. This protection if afforded will go a long way in building confidence of civil servants and will have far reaching impact on performance.

Officials from grade 1-16 which constitute major bulk need to be reorganized. It is recommended that Grade 1-5 be declared as dying cadre and further recruitment should be contract based. For Grade 11-16, a re-evaluation to be done, no direct recruitment to be carried out by departments; and all these posts must be filled through PSC. A mechanism of performance based incentives and accountability be devised.

Quality Metrics be introduced to ensure quality performance; the Workspace should be reoriented to ensure an open, accessible environment. A Tool kit for each department be designed linked with Community feedback mechanism so as to empower

the community to have its say. Use of IT as Enabler. Using IT as enabler, e-Government Portal be introduced with easily understandable user interface and capacity to ability Measure service time and data management.

Each government department to notify and implement a Citizen Charter whereby they should identify and commit to provide specific services as per notified timelines. The aim is to enhance public awareness regarding service delivery parameters and standards to ensure Citizen accountability and procedural transparency. The system of Time bound complaint redressal will be inbuilt through IT mechanism. Digitalized Basic Services can be provided through Citizen's portal and mobile applications, ensuring privacy and security. This will also help in data enabled decision making. This will go a long way in assessment of public needs which can be done through Outsourced Public Surveys to identify important local projects. Digitized feedback mechanisms can also be linked with KPIs and PERs which will ensure accountability.

Political leadership of Pakistan across all parties, under the auspices of President of Pakistan should deliberate upon measures required to address the governance issues and develop consensus on matters affecting public at large through "Meesaq-e-Nau." As Local governments have a major role in service delivery at the grass root level, therefore, it is recommended that basic structure, functions and powers of Local Governments should be constitutionally approved with timeline of local government elections to ensure standardized and empowered local governments across the country. There is a dire need to ensure national standardization of essential services like education and health, besides agreeing on a uniform police law as per the judgment of Supreme Court. In order to ensure inexpensive and expeditious justice as promised by the constitution, a separate reform efforts be undertaken in collaboration with judiciary. However, concurrently, a standardized system of alternate dispute resolution be launched across the country to resolve petty disputes on priority. Process of rationalization of government structure and privatization of the top loss making SOEs as already approved by the government be expedited. NFC Awards be reviewed to ensure contribution of Provinces towards National Debt, Defence and Internal Security.

Conclusion

Public service delivery is pivotal to meeting ends of national security seen through the prism of human security. Extensive exercise has been undertaken throughout the years to carryout civil services reforms. However, politicization and interest groups within the civil services remain a major challenge to effective implementation. Unlike yester years, the 18th amendment further poses challenges to what the Federal Government could carry out. The essence in public service delivery lies in the devolution of power; and its efficacy depends upon a futuristic and adaptive approach to fulfil the social contract. Given the precarious economic and political conditions in the country, it is imperative to take stock and implement the reforms package for positively impacting the HDI and UN SDG indicators of Pakistan, positively affecting Comprehensive National Security of Pakistan.

Endnotes

¹ National Security Division, Government of Pakistan, '*National Security Policy of Pakistan 2022-2026*'. 2022, 6.

² Sustainable Solutions for Human Security and Anti-Corruption: Integrating Theories and Practices by Marco Tavanti 2013.

<https://repository.usfca.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1018&context=pna>. Accessed on 12 September 21.

³ UNDP's Human Security paradigm, adopted from UN Human Security Handbook

⁴ Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Balochistan and Azad Jammu & Kashmir Public Service Commissions

⁵ National Task Force Report on Institutional Reforms in the Federal Government, August 2021.

⁶ National Institute of Management. (2020). *Mid-Career Management: Course Guidelines and Instructions*. Peshawar: NIM.

⁷ Ibid

⁸ Government of Pakistan (2018). *Civil Service Regulations*. Islamabad: Finance Division.

⁹ Dr. Hussain Ishrat (2018), "Governing the Ungovernable", Oxford University Press Karachi, pg-49.

¹⁰ Jafri, A. (2013). *Public Service Ethics in Pakistan*. In M. Sabharwal, & E. M. Berman, *Public Administration in South Asia India, Bangladesh and Pakistan* (pp. 429-437). Boca Raton: Taylor & Francis.

¹¹ World Bank 'Worldwide Governance Indicators' report 2022

¹² The UK's Citizens' Charter initiative aroused considerable interest around the world and several countries implemented similar programmes e.g. Australia (Service Charter,1997), Belgium (Public Service Users' Charter 1992), Canada (Service Standards Initiative, 1995), France (Service Charter, 1992), India (Citizens' Charter, 1997),Jamaica (Citizens' Charter 1994), Malaysia (Client Charter,1993), Singapore, Portugal (The Quality Charter in Public Services, 1993), and Spain(The Quality Observatory, 1992)